

~~TOP SECRET~~

D R A F T

Minutes of First Meeting of Ad Hoc Committee on ^{Portuguese} ~~French~~ Communication Security

3 July 1951

PRESENT

Mr. William F. FRIEDMAN, AFSA, Chairman
 Colonel Gordon E. DAWSON, USA, ID
 Lt. Colonel Fred COLLINS, USA, ID
 Mr. Winston SCOTT, CIA

Mr. FRIEDMAN opened the meeting by reading a memorandum from Admiral STONE dated 2 July 1951 concerning the appointment by USCIB at its Sixty-fifth Meeting of an ad hoc committee, composed of the members of the U.S. delegation to the U.S./U.K. Conference on French Security, to keep developments pertaining to French Communication Security under continuous review and to advise USCIB of the appropriate time for taking further action in the premises. In view of the impending detachment from AFSA of Admiral STONE, and the temporary absence of Colonel COLLINS of AFSA, Mr. William F. FRIEDMAN had been appointed by Admiral STONE to act as chairman of this ad hoc committee until further notice. (The Committee's members formerly were: Admiral STONE, USN, CHAIRMAN; Colonel S.P. COLLINS, USA, AFSA; Colonel Gordon E. DAWSON, USA, ID; Mr. Winston SCOTT, CIA; Mr. William F. FRIEDMAN, AFSA; and Mr. R.F. PACKARD, Department of State.)

Mr. FRIEDMAN stated that as Acting CHAIRMAN he had called the present meeting to consider the security aspects of Portuguese communications and to prepare an evaluation of Portuguese communication security to be submitted by Admiral STONE to USCIB at that Board's next regular meeting Friday, 13 July. As background for the meeting Mr. FRIEDMAN then read

~~TOP SECRET~~

Declassified and approved for
 release by NSA on 11-20-2014
 pursuant to E.O. 13526

~~TOP SECRET~~~~TOP SECRET~~

the draft minutes of Item 2 of the Sixty-fifth Meeting (U.S./French and U.K./French COMINT Relations) and noted the decisions made by USCIB:

* * *

"1. To defer consideration until the next meeting of a report by CIA on M. Boursicot's visit.

2. That the U.S. delegation to the U.S./U.K. Conference on French Security would study and evaluate Portuguese communication security and that the Coordinator would report thereon to the Board.

3. That when disclosing certain types of particularly sensitive information to NATO countries whose methods of transmission are known to be insecure, there should be a stipulation made in advance that such information may not be passed on by any electrical communication means, but if essential to pass on, a secure courier must be used."

OGA

* * *

~~TOP SECRET~~

~~TOP SECRET~~~~TOP SECRET~~

Mr. FRIEDMAN indicated that he had asked AFSA-Q2 for a report on Portuguese security similar to that which had been made by that office on French security and that this report would be available by Monday morning, 9 July, in order that the committee might study it in preparation for its report to Admiral STONE.

With regard to the French communication security situation, Colonel COLLINS stated that although the final report on this question had gone from USCIB to the National Security Council (NSC), it had not yet been put on the agenda and, insofar as he knew, General MARSHALL had not yet been briefed on this matter by General BOLLING. Colonel DAWSON indicated

~~TOP SECRET~~

~~TOP SECRET~~~~TOP SECRET~~

that if the paper is approved by the NSC, he thought the next step should be to go forward with an approach not to M. PARODI, as recommended in the paper, but to M. François le DUC, who was the head of the French delegation of the Tripartite Security Working Group, is a member of the French Foreign Office on loan to the French Department of Defense, and is known to be a very good security man. In reply to the statement by the CHAIRMAN that any change in approach would be subject to agreement by the British, Colonel DAWSON said he felt certain Sir Robert MACKENZIE of the British Foreign Office would agree with his suggestion, as would also Mr. John ELLIOTT of the Department of State. Colonel DAWSON also indicated that M. GROUSSET who is in charge of the Cipher Department of the French Foreign Ministry and who acts as its security officer had expressed in recent conversations with Sir Robert MACKENZIE his desire to go further into discussions of French cryptographic security but that authorization would first have to be obtained. Colonel DAWSON indicated that M. GROUSSET who is elderly and not an expert in technical cryptography should be replaced by a man more technically competent, and that that would be a first step in increasing French security. The CHAIRMAN remarked that perhaps M. GROUSSET could be persuaded to take on a capable assistant and that this would equally change the cryptographic picture. He stated that recent inquiries in AFSA-02 had shown that the French have not changed their system or practices and that the same insecurities remain. Colonel DAWSON remarked that any improvement would take approximately one year, since changes in the cryptographic systems of the

~~TOP SECRET~~

~~TOP SECRET~~~~TOP SECRET~~
~~TOP SECRET~~

separate bureaus would take at least six months to effect. He noted that the committee on internal security which had been set up after the cessation of hostilities in 1945 had died and been revived only in February 1951 when it had been reconstituted under a man from the Council of State.

To Mr. FRIEDMAN's inquiry as to the status of the report of the Tripartite Security Working Group, Col. DAWSON replied that it was ready for General BRADLEY and that his supplemental report was also ready, pending Air Force approval. The Army, Navy, and CIA had already approved it; he was not sure about the approval of the FBI. He stated that General MARSHALL had read the report, and that Mr. John ELLIOT of the State Department would brief Mr. ACHESON, Secretary of State.

With regard to the USCIB proposal that information of high security value should go by courier, Mr. SCOTT said that General SMITH was anxious that everything should go by courier and that it seemed reasonable to make such a request in view of the precedent which had been set with regard to METRIC and COSMIC traffic. Colonel DAWSON also pointed out that this was more important now than previously, since at the present time NATO was beyond the planning and organizational stage and that much material was now operational. He expressed the opinion that time was not an obstacle, since courier service to and from Paris was now on a 5-day a week basis, and that it was therefore not too great a burden to send all traffic by courier. Colonel DAWSON stated that the previous report on this matter in regard to COSMIC traffic (DC 2/7) advised courier pouch for all except

~~TOP SECRET~~

~~TOP SECRET~~~~TOP SECRET~~EO 3.3(h)(2)
PL 86-36/50 USC 3605

most urgent matters and Typex Mark II for messages necessarily requiring electrical transmission.

Colonel COLLINS raised the question whether the ad hoc committee should inform USCIB that French internal and personnel security had now reached a point of improvement where implementation to the proposals might be given. Colonel DAWSON pointed out that although there had been improvement, it was a question whether there had been sufficient improvement. Mr. SCOTT also remarked that there were indications that the President of the U.S. was not favorably impressed with the proposal to

and that it was possible that the paper would not be approved. Mr. FRIEDMAN read to the committee the letter from General SMITH to NSC forwarding the report. This letter stated that the results of the Tripartite General Security discussions were to be considered by USCIB and LSIB before any implementing action is undertaken, a matter which had not yet come before these two bodies.

OGA

6
~~TOP SECRET~~

~~TOP SECRET~~~~TOP SECRET~~

[REDACTED]

possible damage to U.S. security from Portuguese insecurity and asked Colonel DAWSON to prepare a brief on this topic from information available to I.D., GSUSA. Mr. FRIEDMAN said that he would also ask Mr. PACKARD of State Department to prepare a paper on this subject based on information available to that Department. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

The meeting adjourned, to meet again on Monday, 9 July at 1430 hours.

OGA

~~TOP SECRET~~